

Capital Subcommittee
Report of Hearing December 6, 2016 and December 13, 2016
Reserve Fund Transfer Request

The Capital Subcommittee met at 6:30 pm in Room 103 at Town Hall. Committee members present were Cliff Brown, Harry Friedman, Fred Levitan, and Pamela Lodish. Also in attendance were Acting Chief Robert Ward, Acting Chief of Operations Chief Keith Flaherty, Charlie Driver, Chief Mechanic, Lt. Paul Trahon, Fire Fighter Union President Local 950 IAFF, Anthony Ansaldi, Brookline Public Safety Business Manager and Melissa Goff, Deputy Town Manager. Also present were Advisory Committee members, David-Mark Goldstein and Janice Kahn.

All ladder trucks go through annual testing and every five years they have a non-destructive test. Last week two of the Town's three ladder trucks failed inspection due to rotted frame rails. Ladder 1 (1995 Pierce) and Ladder 12 (1998 Pierce) were immediately and permanently taken out of service, leaving the Town with only one ladder truck Ladder 2 (2016 KME). A replacement for Ladder 1 has recently been ordered as a part of the FY2016 Capital Improvement Program. Delivery of the replacement for Ladder 1 is expected in March of 2018. The Fire Department luckily was able to borrow a reserve Quint from the City of Newton, to be used as a ladder truck on a limited basis. Quint Fire Trucks are combinations of ladder trucks and engine trucks and can be used for either purpose but not both purposes without extra manning. While we were fortunate to be able to borrow this piece of equipment, it is not in great shape, and burns four quarts of oil per day, which could lead to the motor seizing, a repair for which we would be responsible. Newton could have equipment issues as well and at any time could ask that their truck be returned.

A Nationwide search for a used ladder truck was conducted. Three potential ladder trucks were located, resulting in the three options detailed below.

Option 1, was found on Long Island, NY and is a 1998 Seagrave 100' Ariel Ladder with 23,000 miles on it. It is priced at \$85,000. This truck has a 100' ladder with a waterway. The truck was inspected by Charlie Driver and Paul Trahon and found to be in good condition. The negatives discussed included the fact that this truck is only medium weight ladder with a tip weight of 250 pounds. Normally, all Brookline ladder trucks are heavy or super heavy duty, with tip weights of between 500 and 750 pounds. (The heavier the tip weight, the more fire personnel or people being rescued that can be on the ladder at any one time). This truck would be subject to MGL 30B purchasing requirements, which would require it be put out for bid. While we had expected to be able to purchase and obtain this truck in very short order, there would be a minimum 30 day delay due to MGL 30B. We have subsequently learned that this truck would not be available to us until a replacement truck was delivered to the current owner. Where we need a replacement truck able to be placed in front line service until the replacement for Ladder 1 is delivered in March of 2018, this truck was not considered as optimal for front line service.

Option 2, was located in Missouri and is a 1990 Pierce Arrow 105' Ladder with 24,000 miles on it. It is priced at \$98,500. It has a 105' ladder with build in waterway. It is a heavy-duty ladder. This truck would also be subject to MGL 30B and due to its age, was not considered optimal for front line duty.

Option 3, was located at the Pierce factory in Wisconsin. This is a 2016 truck (manufactured in March 2016) and was used as a demo truck at trade shows and was shown to Fire Departments in the US. The truck is a 107-foot heavy-duty truck with multiplexing. It is priced \$865,724. This truck would not be subject to MGL 30B as it is a new vehicle and is covered under already approved pricing under a national purchasing consortium. This truck has been driven for 12,000 miles (travelling to and from trade shows, and would be delivered as new, with a full warranty that would begin once the truck was put into service. Warranty lengths would be 5 years for the engine and transmission, 3 years for the

axles, 5 years for paint and corrosion. The frame carries a lifetime warranty but excludes damages caused by chemicals (salt). The value of this truck is in excess of \$1 million and is being discounted as it has 12,000 miles and was used as a demo.

The view of the fire personnel at the hearing was that option three, the purchase of an essentially new ladder truck, was the preferred solution.

Funding of the purchase of a new truck or replacement truck was discussed. The FY 2017 Reserve Fund Appropriation is \$2,348,737. The uncommitted balance is \$2,309,557. Melissa Goff explained that she has spoken with Gary McCabe, Chief Assessor and believes that due to the recent win of cases brought by both Verizon and RCN at the Mass Appellate Tax Board, there could potentially be one million dollars available surplus from the tax overlay account to cover additional shortfalls if the snow season is particularly challenging.

A number of issues were discussed including, the question of why these truck's frames have rotted quicker than expected. The issue of having medical emergencies handled by smaller vehicles was also discussed at length. It was the view of fire personnel that the current system appears to work best due to the need to keep fire companies together with their vehicle so that they are available at all times to respond to and to fires.

Also discussed were the ramifications of having three new ladder trucks and the complications this would cause when the time arrived for both refurbishment and for replacement.

Further discussions took place about the potential need for a ladder truck to cover South Brookline from a location closer than Brookline Village due to increased development at Hancock Village and the new 9th school at Baldwin. This would mean an expansion of fire department personnel by 24 members and was not within the scope of our discussions.

Melissa Goff and members of Fire Department officials were asked to investigate the necessity to shorten or adjust the current schedule for refurbishment and replacement of fire equipment through the CIP.

A vote was not taken on December 6, 2016 but a polling of the Capital Subcommittee members showed that no one was opposed to option 3.

A second meeting of the Capital Subcommittee was held on December 13, 2016, at which time the subcommittee voted (add vote) and recommends favorable action on the purchase of the 2016 Pierce Ladder Truck, i.e., option 3 outlined above.